

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

**IN RE: DIET DRUGS
(PHENTERMINE, FENFLURAMINE,
DEXFENFLURAMINE) PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION**

MDL DOCKET NO. 1203

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO

Rachelle Benn	MDL# 02-20143
Barbara Boyle	MDL# 02-20143
Lisa Charles	MDL# 02-20143
Darlene Coleman	MDL# 02-20143
Gladys Constant	MDL# 02-20135
Elise Daniels	MDL# 02-20143
Edward Deshotel	MDL# 02-20252
Bianca Doubleday	MDL# 02-20135
Jacquelyn Durand	MDL# 02-20143
Toni Durapau	MDL# 02-20135
Gregory Elgin	MDL# 02-20143
Audry Eumont	MDL# 02-20135
Tonya Fava	MDL# 02-20143
Caroline Favorite	MDL# 02-20134
Rose Fox	MDL# 02-20252
Toni Geata	MDL# 02-20140
Brenda Gaines	MDL# 02-20143

Adam Galley	MDL# 02-20135	§
Cheryl Guidry	MDL# 02-20131	§
Elizabeth Guillote	MDL# 02-20143	§
Debbie Hall	MDL# 02-20137	§
Frances Hauser	MDL# 02-20137	§
Wanda Herrington	MDL# 02-20143	§
Joyce Hickman	MDL# 02-20252	§
Cynthia Hill	MDL# 02-20135	§
Pamela Hitchen	MDL# 02-20141	§
Dr. Cathy Honore	MDL# 02-20138	§
Michael Ippolito	MDL# 02-20252	§
Kim Jacob	MDL# 02-20143	§
Lanette Jones	MDL# 02-20252	§
Morris Lewis	MDL# 02-20252	§
Shawnell Livas	MDL# 02-20136	§
Donald Mayeaux	MDL# 02-20143	§
Danita McDaniel	MDL# 02-20143	§
Ruby Merrick	MDL# 02-20143	§
Kathleen Moran	MDL# 02-20143	§
Doris Moreau	MDL# 02-20252	§
Audrey Morgan	MDL# 02-20252	§
Martha Ned	MDL# 02-20143	§

Kimberly Norwood	MDL# 02-20252	§
Mary Owen	MDL# 02-20135	§
Elizabeth Pavy	MDL# 02-20252	§
Mary Payne	MDL# 02-20252	§
Linda Petticrew	MDL# 02-20143	§
Betty Rogers	MDL# 02-20252	§
Janell Rushing	MDL# 02-20143	§
Kristen Silva	MDL# 02-20143	§
Kathryn Smith	MDL# 02-20136	§
Jacquelyn Tolliver	MDL# 02-20138	§
Cynthia Williams	MDL# 02-20132	§

**PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL RESPONSE TO WYETH'S MOTION
CHALLENGING PLAINTIFFS' ELIGIBILITY TO SUE IN 71 CASES WHERE
MEDICAL ELIGIBILITY IS BASED ON ECHOCARDIOGRAM READINGS
BY DR. WILLIAM SHELL**

COME NOW Plaintiffs, and file this their supplemental response to Wyeth's motion to challenge Plaintiffs' eligibility to sue in 71 cases where medical eligibility is based on echocardiogram readings by Dr. William Shell, and in support of said response would show this Honorable Court as follows:

I.

Plaintiffs do not contest the evidence submitted by Wyeth in their motion to dismiss.

II.

For purposes of clarification, The fifty Plaintiffs who are currently the subject of this motion are: Rachelle Benn, Barbara Boyle, Lisa Charles, Darlene Coleman, Gladys Constant, Elise Daniels, Edward Deshotel, Bianca Doubleday, Jacquelyn Durand, Toni Durapau, Gregory Elgin, Audry Eumont, Tonya Fava, Caroline Favorite, Rose Fox, Toni Geata, Brenda Gaines, Adam Galley, Cheryl Guidry, Elizabeth Guillote, Debbie Hall, Frances Hauser, Wanda Herrington, Joyce Hickman, Cynthia Hill, Pamela Hitchen, Dr. Cathy Honore, Michael Ippolito, Kim Jacob, Lanette Jones, Morris Lewis, Shawnell Livas, Donald Mayeaux, Danita McDaniel, Ruby Merrick, Kathleen Moran, Doris Moreau, Audrey Morgan, Martha Ned, Kimberly Norwood, Mary Owen, Elizabeth Pavy, Mary Payne, Linda Petticrew, Betty Rogers, Janell Rushing, Kristen Silva, Kathryn smith, Jacquelyn Tolliver, and Cynthia Williams.

III.

Wyeth has asked this Court to dismiss, with prejudice, each of these Plaintiffs' claims in the diet drug litigation due to the fact that they rely on echocardiograms performed by Dr. William Shell to establish their eligibility to file suit. Plaintiffs contest dismissal of their cases and request that the Court enter an alternate remedy. Plaintiffs would argue that the proper remedy in this case is that the echocardiograms that Plaintiffs rely on be re-read by a neutral, third-party cardiologist and that the opinions issue by that cardiologist be used to determine eligibility.

III.

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Plaintiffs respectfully request that this Court deny Wyeth's motion to dismiss, with prejudice, and order that the above referenced Plaintiffs' echocardiograms be re-read by a neutral third-party cardiologist.

Respectfully submitted,

O'QUINN, LAMINACK & PIRTLE

RICHARD N. LAMINACK

SBOT #11850350

THOMAS W. PIRTLE

SBOT #16038610

BUFFY K. MARTINES

SBOT #24030311

440 Louisiana, Suite 2300

Houston, Texas 77002

Telephone: 713/236-2677

Facsimile: 713/223-4870

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing motion has been forwarded via facsimile to the attached service list on this 24th day of October, 2003.

Gregory P. Miller
MILLER, ALFANO & RASPANTI
1818 Market Street, Suite 3402
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103
Telephone: 215/972-6400
Facsimile: 215/981-0082

SPECIAL DISCOVERY MASTER

Michael Fishbein
LEVIN, FISHBEIN, SEDRAN & BERMAN
510 Walnut, Suite 500
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19106
Telephone: 215/592-1500
Facsimile: 215/592-4663

PLAINTIFFS' MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

Michael T. Scott
Paul Kerrigan
Caroline Flotron
REED SMITH, L.L.P.
1650 Market Street, Suite 2500
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103
Telephone: 215/851-8248
Facsimile: 215/851-1420

LIASON COUNSEL FOR FENFLURAMINE AND DEXFENFLURMINE DEFENDANTS

Peter L. Zimroth
Keri Howe
ARNOLD & PORTER
399 Park Avenue
New York, New York 10022
Telephone: 212/715-1000
Facsimile: 212/715-1399

Peter T. Grossi
Daniel S. Pariser
ARNOLD & PORTER
555 Twelfth Street, N.W.
Washington, D. C. 20004-1206
Telephone: 202/942-5000

Henri Wolbrette, III
Kathleen A. Manning
McGLINCHEY STAFFORD
643 Magazine Street
New Orleans, Louisiana 70130
Telephone: 504/586-1200

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANT WYETH



BUFFY K. MARTINES